

# Second International Nurse Rostering Competition: mathematical model

Sara Ceschia · Nguyen Thi Thanh Dang ·  
Patrick De Causmaecker · Stefaan  
Haspeslagh · Andrea Schaerf

the date of receipt and acceptance should be inserted later

## 1 Mathematical model

Let  $N$  be the set of nurses,  $D$  the set of days in the scheduling period,  $W$  the set of all weekends in the scheduling period,  $S$  the set of shift types and  $SK$  the set of skills. Equation (1) defines the binary decision variables  $x_{n,d,s,sk}$ . These state whether nurse  $n$  is working shift type  $s$  with required skill  $sk$  on day  $d$ .

A set of auxiliary variables  $o_{n,d,s}$  is defined in expression (2). These indicate whether nurse  $n$  works a shift of type  $s$  on day  $d$ . The auxiliary variables  $p_{n,d}$  (4) denote whether nurse  $n$  is working any shift type on day  $d$ . A similar set of auxiliary variables  $q_{n,w}$  is defined in expression (6). These indicate whether nurse  $n$  is working any shift during weekend  $w$ . A weekend  $w$  is defined by its two days  $d_{w,1}$  and  $d_{w,2}$ .

$$\forall n \in N, \forall d \in D, \forall s \in S, \forall sk \in SK :$$

$$x_{n,d,s,sk} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if nurse } n \text{ works shift type } s \text{ with skill } sk \text{ on day } d \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \quad (1)$$

$$\forall n \in N, \forall d \in D, \forall s \in S : o_{n,d,s} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if nurse } n \text{ works shift type } s \text{ on day } d \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \quad (2)$$

---

S. Ceschia · A. Schaerf  
DPIA, University of Udine  
via delle Scienze 206, I-33100, Udine, Italy  
E-mail: {sara.ceschia,schaerf}@uniud.it

N. Thi Thanh Dang · P. De Causmaecker  
KU Leuven, Department of Computer Science, CODES & iMinds-ITEC, KULAK  
E. Sabbelaan 53, 8500 Kortrijk, Belgium  
E-mail: {nguyenthithanh.dang, patrick.decausmaecker}@kuleuven-kulak.be

S. Haspeslagh  
Vives University College, Commercial sciences and business management, MoBiz  
Doorniksesteenweg 145, 8500 Kortrijk, Belgium  
E-mail: stefaan.haspeslagh@vives.be

$$\forall n \in N, \forall d \in D, \forall s \in S : \sum_{sk \in SK} x_{n,d,s,sk} \leq |SK| o_{n,d,s} \text{ and } \sum_{sk \in SK} x_{n,d,s,sk} \geq o_{n,d,s} \quad (3)$$

$$\forall n \in N, \forall d \in D : p_{n,d} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if nurse } n \text{ works any shift type on day } d \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \quad (4)$$

$$\forall n \in N, \forall d \in D : \sum_{s \in S} x_{n,d,s} \leq |S| p_{n,d} \text{ and } \sum_{s \in S} o_{n,d,s} \geq p_{n,d} \quad (5)$$

$$\forall n \in N, \forall w \in W \in S :$$

$$q_{n,w} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if nurse } n \text{ works any shift type during weekend } w \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \quad (6)$$

$$\forall n \in N, \forall w \in W : p_{n,d_{w,2}} \leq 2q_{n,w} + p_{n,d_{w,1}} \text{ and } p_{n,d_{w,1}} + p_{n,d_{w,2}} \geq q_{n,w} \quad (7)$$

### 1.1 Hard constraints

In this section we give a mathematical representation of the hard constraints  $H1$  (8) to  $H4$  (11).

#### *H1. Single assignment per day*

$$\forall n \in N, \forall d \in D : \sum_{s \in S} o_{n,d,s} \leq 1 \quad (8)$$

#### *H2. Under-staffing*

Let  $C_{d,s,sk}^{min}$  denote the minimum number of nurses with skill  $sk$  required for covering a shift  $s$  on day  $d$ , then:

$$\forall d \in D, \forall s \in S, \forall sk \in SK : \sum_{n \in N} x_{n,d,s,sk} \geq C_{d,s,sk}^{min} \quad (9)$$

#### *H3. Shift type successions*

Let  $F$  be the set of forbidden shift type successions. Each  $f \in F$  represents a sequence of two shift types  $s_1$  and  $s_2$  that is forbidden. T.i. a shift  $s_2$  cannot follow a shift type  $s_1$ .

$$\forall n \in N, \forall d \in D, \forall f \in F : o_{n,d,s_1} + o_{n,d+1,s_2} \leq 1 \quad (10)$$

#### H4. Missing required skill

Let  $SK_n$  be the set of skills of nurse  $n$ , then:

$$\forall n \in N, \forall d \in D, \forall s \in S, \forall sk \in SK \setminus SK_n : x_{n,d,s,sk} = 0 \quad (11)$$

### 1.2 Soft Constraints

The objective is to minimize the following sum (12) subject to the linear expressions in equations (13 - 35).

$$\begin{aligned} \text{MINIMIZE } & W^{C^{opt}} V(C^{opt}) + W^{CW^{max}} V(CW^{max}) + W^{CW^{min}} V(CW^{min}) + \\ & W^{CF^{max}} V(CF^{max}) + W^{CF^{min}} V(CF^{min}) + W^{CW} V(CW) + \\ & W^{SOR} V(SOR) + W^{DOR} V(DOR) + \\ & W^{T^{max}} V(T^{max}) + W^{T^{min}} V(T^{min}) + W^{TW^{max}} V(TW^{max}) \end{aligned} \quad (12)$$

The soft constraints in the problem are described below. Each constraint type  $C$  has an associate weight  $W_n^C$ .

#### S1. Insufficient staffing for optimal coverage

The number  $C_{d,s,sk}^{opt}$  denotes the optimal number of nurses with skill  $sk$  that should be assigned a shift  $s$  on day  $d$ . The number of constraint violations  $V(C^{opt})$  is calculated in equation (13).

$$V(C^{opt}) = \sum_{n \in N} \sum_{d \in D} \sum_{s \in S} \max\{C_{d,s,sk}^{opt} - \sum_{sk \in SK} x_{n,d,s,sk}, 0\} \quad (13)$$

#### S2. Consecutive assignments

The number  $CW_n^{max}$  and  $CW_n^{min}$  limit the maximum and minimum number of consecutive working days for each nurse  $n$ . The total number of constraint violations  $V(CW^{max})$  and  $V(CW^{min})$  are counted in equations (14) and (15), subject to the inequalities in expressions (19) and (21). For  $d > 0$ , the auxiliary variables  $tw_{n,d,0}$  in inequalities (19) indicate whether nurse  $n$  works on day  $d$  while he or she is free on day  $d - 1$ . The auxiliary variables  $tw_{n,d,i}$  in inequalities (21) indicate whether there is a consecutive row of working days (of length  $i$ ) for nurse  $n$  since day  $d$ . The variable  $h_n^{CW}$  denotes the number of consecutive shifts a nurse is working at the end of the previous planning horizon and is used for proper initialization of the auxiliary variables  $tw_{n,d,i}$ . When a nurse has at least one day off at the end of the previous planning horizon,  $h_n^{CW} = 0$ .

$$V(CW^{max}) = \sum_{n \in N} \sum_{d=-h_n^{CW}}^{|D|-1-CW_n^{max}} \max\left\{\left(\sum_{i=0}^{CW_n^{max}} tw_{n,d,i}\right) - CW_n^{max}, 0\right\} \quad (14)$$

$$V(CW^{min}) = \sum_{n \in N} \sum_{d \in D} (CW_n^{min} t_{n,d,0} - \sum_{i=0}^{CW_n^{min}-1} t_{n,d,i}) \quad (15)$$

$$tw_{n,d,0} = p_{n,d} \text{ for } d = 0 \quad (16)$$

$$tw_{n,d,i} = 1 \text{ for } -h_n^{CW} \leq d < 0, 0 < i \leq CW_n^{max} \quad (17)$$

$$tw_{n,d,i} = 0 \text{ for } d < -h_n^{CW}, 0 < i \leq CW_n^{max} \quad (18)$$

$$0 \leq tw_{n,d,0} \leq 1 - p_{n,d-1} \text{ and } p_{n,d} - p_{n,d-1} \leq tw_{n,d,0} \leq p_{n,d} \text{ for } d > 0 \quad (19)$$

$$0 \leq tw_{n,d,i} \leq p_{n,d} \text{ and } t_{n,d,i} \leq tw_{n,d,i-1} \text{ for } 0 < i \leq CW_n^{max} \quad (20)$$

$$tw_{n,d,i} = 0 \text{ for } d > |D|, 0 < i \leq CW_n^{max} \quad (21)$$

### S3. Consecutive days-off

Similarly, the numbers  $CF_n^{max}$  and  $CF_n^{min}$  limit the maximum and minimum number of consecutive free days for each nurse  $n$ . The total number of constraint violations  $V(CF^{max})$  and  $V(CF^{min})$  are counted in equations (22) and (23), subject to the inequalities in (27) and (29). For  $d > 0$ , the auxiliary variables  $tf_{n,d,0}$  in the inequalities (27) indicate whether nurse  $n$  works on day  $d-1$  while he or she is free on day  $d$ . The auxiliary variables  $tf_{n,d,i}$  in the inequalities (29) indicate whether there is a consecutive row of free days (of length  $i$ ) for nurse  $n$  since day  $d$ . Again, the variable  $h_n^{CF}$  denotes the number of consecutive free shifts a nurse has at the end of the previous planning horizon and is used for proper initialization of the auxiliary variables  $tf_{n,d,i}$ . When a nurse is working at the end of the previous planning horizon,  $h_n^{CF} = 0$ .

$$V(CF^{max}) = \sum_{n \in N} \sum_{d=-h_n^{CF}}^{|D|-1-CF_n^{max}} \max\left\{\left(\sum_{i=0}^{CF_n^{max}} t_{n,d,i}\right) - CF_n^{max}, 0\right\} \quad (22)$$

$$V(CF^{min}) = \sum_{n \in N} \sum_{d=0}^{|D|-CF_n^{min}} (CF_n^{min} tf_{n,d,0} - \sum_{i=0}^{CF_n^{min}-1} tf_{n,d,i}) \quad (23)$$

$$tf_{n,d,0} = 1 - p_{n,d} \text{ for } d = 0 \quad (24)$$

$$tf_{n,d,i} = 1 \text{ for } -h_n^{CF} \leq d < 0, 0 < i \leq CF_n^{max} \quad (25)$$

$$tf_{n,d,i} = 0 \text{ for } d < -h_n^{CF}, 0 < i \leq CF_n^{max} \quad (26)$$

$$0 \leq tf_{n,d,0} \leq p_{n,d-1} \text{ and } p_{n,d-1} - p_{n,d} \leq tf_{n,d,0} \leq 1 - p_{n,d} \text{ for } d > 0 \quad (27)$$

$$0 \leq tf_{n,d,i} \leq 1 - p_{n,d} \text{ and } tf_{n,d,i} \leq tf_{n,d,i-1} \text{ for } 0 < i \leq CF_n^{max} \quad (28)$$

$$tf_{n,d,i} = 0 \text{ for } d > |D|, 0 < i \leq CF_n^{max} \quad (29)$$

#### S4. Preferences

We distinguish two types of requests. In the general case, a nurse  $n$  asks not to be assigned a shift  $s$  on a particular day  $d$ . Let  $SOR$  be the set of shift off requests, each  $sor \in SOR$  is a tuple  $(n, d, s)$  and represents such a shift off request.

$$V(SOR) = \sum_{sor \in SOR} o_{n,d,s} \quad (30)$$

In the other case, the special shift type *Any* is given and thus the nurse is requesting a day-off. Let  $DOR$  be the set of day-off requests, each  $dor \in DOR$  is a tuple  $(n, d)$  and represents such a day-off request.

$$V(DOR) = \sum_{dor \in DOR} p_{n,d} \quad (31)$$

#### S5. Complete weekend

$CW_n \in \{1, 0\}$  specifies whether or not nurse  $n$  should work either both days or no days at all during a weekend<sup>1</sup>. The total number of constraint violations  $V(CW)$  is defined in equation (32).

$$V(CW) = \sum_{n \in N} \sum_{w \in W} CW_n (2q_{n,w} - (p_{n,d_{w,1}} + p_{n,d_{w,2}})) \quad (32)$$

#### S6. Total assignments

Numbers  $T_n^{max}$  and  $T_n^{min}$  on the total workload of nurses limit respectively the maximum and minimum number of shifts assigned per nurse  $n$ . The total number of constraint violations  $V(T^{max})$  and  $V(T^{min})$  are counted in equations (33) and (34).

$$V(T^{max}) = \sum_{n \in N} \max\left\{\left(\sum_{d \in D} \sum_{s \in S} o_{n,d,s}\right) - T_n^{max}, 0\right\} \quad (33)$$

$$V(T^{min}) = \sum_{n \in N} \max\left\{T_n^{min} - \left(\sum_{d \in D} \sum_{s \in S} o_{n,d,s}\right), 0\right\} \quad (34)$$

#### S7. Total working weekends

Number  $TW_n^{max}$  limits the total number of weekends nurse  $n$  can work. The total number of constraint violations  $V(TW^{max})$  is counted in equation (35)

$$V(TW^{max}) = \sum_{n \in N} \max\left\{\sum_{w \in W} q_{n,w} - TW_n^{max}, 0\right\} \quad (35)$$

---

<sup>1</sup>  $CW_n = 1$  if nurse  $n$  needs to work complete weekends,  $CW_n = 0$  if she or he can work an arbitrary number of days in a weekend.

## 2 List of definitions

Symbol	Definition
$N$	Set of nurses $n$
$D$	Set of days $d$
$W$	Set of weekends $w$
$S$	Set of shift types $s$
$SK$	Set of skills $sk$
$x_{n,s,d,sk}$	Variable denoting whether a nurse $n$ works a shift $s$ requiring skill $sk$ on day $d$
$o_{n,s,d}$	Variable denoting whether a nurse $n$ works a shift $s$ on day $d$ for any possible skill
$p_{n,d}$	Variable denoting whether a nurse $n$ works any shift on day $d$
$q_{n,w}$	Variable denoting whether a nurse $n$ works any shift during any day in weekend $w$
$d_{w,1}, d_{w,2}$	Variables denoting the two days in weekend $w$
$C_{d,s,sk}^{min}$	the minimum number of nurses with skill $sk$ required for covering a shift $s$ on day $d$
$F$	set of forbidden shift type successions $f$
$f$	A sequence of two shifts $s_1$ and $s_2$ that is forbidden
$SK_n$	sets of skill $sk$ for which nurse $n$ has sufficient qualifications
$C_{d,s,sk}^{opt}$	Variable denoting the optimal number of nurses with skill $sk$ that should be assigned a shift $s$ on day $d$
$CW_n^{max}$	the maximum number of consecutive working days for nurse $n$
$CW_n^{min}$	the minimum number of consecutive working days for nurse $n$
$tw_{n,d,0}$	Variable denoting whether nurse $n$ works on day $d$ while he or she is free on day $d-1$
$tw_{n,d,i}$	Variables denoting whether there is a consecutive row of working days of length $i$ for nurse $n$ since day $d$
$h_n^{CW}$	Variable denoting the number of consecutive days a nurse is working at the end of the previous planning horizon
$CF_n^{max}$	the maximum number of consecutive free days for nurse $n$
$CF_n^{min}$	the minimum number of consecutive free days for nurse $n$
$tf_{n,d,0}$	Variable denoting whether nurse $n$ is free on day $d$ while he or she is working on day $d-1$
$tf_{n,d,i}$	Variables denoting whether there is a consecutive row of free days of length $i$ for nurse $n$ since day $d$
$h_n^{CF}$	Variable denoting the number of consecutive days off a nurse has at the end of the previous planning horizon
$SOR$	Set of shift off requests $sor$
$sor$	A tuple $(n,d,s)$ denoting a request not the be assigned a shift $s$ on day $d$ for nurse $n$
$DOR$	Set of day off requests $dor$
$dor$	A tuple $(n,d)$ denoting a request not the be assigned any shift on day $d$ for nurse $n$
$CW_n$	Variable denoting whether nurse $n$ has to work complete weekends
$T_n^{max}$	Variable denoting the maximum number of assignments for nurse $n$
$T_n^{min}$	Variable denoting the minimum number of assignments for nurse $n$